



STATE OF NEW JERSEY

**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION
OF THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION**

In the Matter of Jessica Schutte,
Management Specialist (M0257C),
Paterson

CSC Docket No. 2022-952

Examination Appeal

CORRECTED DECISION

ISSUED: JULY 13, 2022 (RE)

Jessica Schutte appeals the decision of the Division of Agency Services (Agency Services) which found that, per the substitution clause for education, she did not meet the experience requirements for the open competitive examination for Management Specialist (M0257C), Paterson.

The subject examination announcement was issued with a closing date of August 23, 2021. The examination was open to residents of Paterson City who met the requirements of graduation from an accredited college or university with a Bachelor’s degree, and two years of experience in the review, analysis, and evaluation of budget, organization, and administrative practices and recommending improved methods, and/or administrative experience in varied phases of business, industrial, or government involving the organization, direction, planning, coordination, or control of programs or activities. Applicants who did not meet the educational requirement could substitute additional experience as described on a year-for-year basis with 30 semester hour credits being equal to one year of experience. The appellant was found to be below the minimum requirements in experience, per the substitution clause for education. One candidate appeared on the eligible list, which was certified, and the candidate was appointed.

The appellant indicated that she possessed 4 college credits, which prorates to one month of experience. Per the substitution clause for education, the appellant was required to possess five years, eleven months of applicable experience. On her application, the appellant listed experience in seven positions, provisional Management Specialist from January 2021 to August 2021; Keyboarding Clerk 1

from the September 2018 to January 2021; Summer Youth Program Coordinator (overlaps with the next position, part-time 15 hours a week) from June 2018 to September 2018; Construction Administration with Paterson Habitat for Humanity (part-time, 30 hours per week) from February 2018 to September 2018; Americorp Member with Saint Paul's CDC from June 2016 to September 2017; Customer Service Representative with Bed Bath & Beyond from July 2014 to April 2015; and Office Manager with Harvest Lawn Care from July 2005 to June 2013. The appellant was credited with eight months in the first position, two years, four months in the second position, and one year, four months in the fifth position. As this equates to four years, four months, the appellant was found to be lacking one year, seven months of experience, per the substitution clause for education.

On appeal, the appellant argues that she accrued applicable experience in her positions as a Summer Youth Program Coordinator, Construction Administration, Americorp Member and Office Manager.

CONCLUSION

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.3(b) provides that applicants shall meet all requirements specified in the open competitive examination announcement by the closing date.

The appellant was denied admittance to the subject examination since she lacked one year, seven months of experience per the substitution clause for education. A review of appellant's application reveals that this determination is correct. At the outset, it is noted that titles are categorized as professional, para-professional or non-professional. *N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-2.5(a)1 states that professional titles require at least a Bachelor's or higher-level degree, with or without a clause to substitute experience. Thus, since the Management Specialist title requires completion of a Bachelor's degree with a substitution clause, which permits additional experience in lieu of the college credits, as well as relevant experience, it is considered a professional title.

The appellant's prior-held title of Keyboarding Clerk 1 does not require a Bachelor's degree and therefore is not a professional title. *N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-2.5(a)3 states that non-professional titles require less than 60 general college credits or less than 12 specific college credits, while *N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-2.5(a)2 states that para-professional titles require at least 60 general college credits or 12 or more specific college credits (but less than a full degree). As such, the title Keyboarding Clerk 1 is a non-professional title since no college credits are required. Although the appellant received credit for this experience, the duties indicated do not support that the announced experience was the primary focus. For example, the appellant indicated that her duties included printing, entering and submitting payroll; receiving, screening, reviewing and verifying documents for payroll; maintaining records and files; compiling information and data; and typing. All of these duties

are clerical in nature. The appellant then supplies “ADDED duties while serving as Keyboarding Clerk 1,” although she does not provide the dates or time that these duties were performed. The added duties include supervisory duties, and the appellant indicated that she supervised nine professional staff and 16 support staff. The additional duties also included those related to purchasing, ordering supplies, budgeting, and coordinating the maintenance and repair of buildings and property. Those duties are clearly outside of the purview of a Keyboarding Clerk 1, the lowest title in the clerical title series. However, those duties, while out-of-title, do not match the announced experience requirements. Further, given two completely different sets of duties for one-time period, the time for each cannot be quantified.

Additionally, as a Summer Youth Program Coordinator, the appellant interviewed and obtained placement for summer interns, managed and maintained personnel files, created workshops and submitted payroll for the interns. As Construction Administration, the appellant maintained construction files, communicated with vendors and crews, solicited quotes, provided RFP recommendations, scheduled repairs, and performed onsite inspections. As an Americorp Member, the appellant coordinated summer events for children, organized fundraising, administrated the webpage, co-facilitated enrichment activities for children and a feeding program, and managed student information. As a Customer Service Representative, the appellant answered calls, creating, modifying and cancelling orders, answered questions, checked inventory, logged complaints and responded to customers in writing. As an Office Manager, the appellant managed routes for lawn and tree services, trained office personnel and delegated tasks, monitored service calls, maintained client information, kept inventory, managed accounts receivable, made bank deposits, handled mail, made copies and kept files. None of these positions had the announced experience requirement as the primary focus. As she cannot receive credit for her experience as a Keyboarding Clerk 1, the second position on her application, or for Americorp Member, the fifth position on her application, only her provisional experience is applicable. As she lacks five years, three months of required experience as of the August 2021 closing date.

The appellant was denied admittance to the subject examination since she lacked the minimum requirements in experience per the substitution clause for education. An independent review of all material presented indicates that the decision of Agency Services that the appellant did not meet the announced requirements for eligibility by the closing date is amply supported by the record. The appellant provides no basis to disturb this decision. Thus, the appellant has failed to support her burden of proof in this matter.

ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that this appeal be denied.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review is to be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON
THE 2nd DAY OF FEBRUARY, 2022



Deirdré L. Webster Cobb
Chairperson
Civil Service Commission

Inquiries
and
Correspondence

Allison Chris Myers
Division of Appeals
and Regulatory Affairs
Civil Service Commission
Written Record Appeals Unit
P.O. Box 312
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c: Jessica Schutte
Kathleen Long
Division of Agency Services
Records Center